

Glocal Identities in Translation

Manuela Palacios González¹

University of Santiago de Compostela in Spain
E-mail: manuela.palacios@usc.es

Abstract

In spite of the globalizing tendencies that promote English as a *lingua franca*, the vernacular languages of various European regions have devised a series of strategies, in order to survive and become visible, which include the strengthening of cultural bonds with other minoritized languages and translation projects among them, with or without the mediation of English. The present paper analyzes a number of translations of Irish and Galician poetry by paying attention to their construction of *glocal* identities, as the local is transferred to a *foreign* language and culture. I will focus on the notion of place, since Ireland and Galicia have often been construed as sharing, among other characteristics, similar geographical and landscape features. Although I will discuss a number of examples where the mutual recognition of place is facilitated, I will also be attentive to various signals of resistance to such recognition.

Keywords: *Galician poetry, Irish poetry, vernacular languages, transnationalism, locality*

In her translation of María Lado's poem "tres" / "three",² the Irish poet Máighréad Medbh chose to leave one word in Galician, without translation, and to explain its meaning in a footnote. Lado's poem presents the struggles of the inhabitants of a small island that is ferociously pounded by an ocean where ships wreck and lose their cargo. This seascape immediately conjures a notorious stretch of the Galician coast known as Costa da Morte [Coast of Death],³ a name that is commonly associated with the numerous shipwrecks in this area but that may also derive from the fact that the sun sets on the western coast of Galicia. Costa da Morte is also Lado's home locality in Galicia and the place where she initiated her literary career alongside a group of poets called Batallón Literario da Costa da Morte [Literary Battalion of Costa da Morte].

The word that Máighréad Medbh chose not to translate was "percebes" and her explanation of the term in her footnote was "'Percebes" are gooseneck barnacles, a delicacy in Galicia".⁴ As the co-editor — together with the Irish writer Mary O'Donnell — of the anthology *To the Winds Our Sails*,⁵ where both the original poem and its

¹ This essay is part of the research project "Ex-sistere", on Irish and Galician women writers, funded by the Spanish Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad (FFI2012-35872).

² María Lado, "tres," in *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, ed. Mary O'Donnell and Manuela Palacios (Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010), 138.

³ The translations in square brackets are by the author of this article, while those in quotation marks are by each respective writer here discussed.

⁴ Máighréad Medbh, "three," in *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, ed. Mary O'Donnell and Manuela Palacios (Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010), 139.

⁵ *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry* (O'Donnell and Palacios, 2010) gathers the poems of ten Galician women writers and their respective translations, into English and Irish, by a number of Irish poets. With these translations, Irish writers want to reciprocate the longstanding interest

English translation appeared, I have always been intrigued by Medbh's choice — which I did not interfere with — and by the robust presence of that non-translated word, which is additionally typed in bold both in the original and in the translated versions: “e é por iso que os **percebes** enganán con voces de serea” / “and **percebes** sing them like sirens”.⁶ The translated line gains in terseness both with its omission of the initial clause and its causal phrase (and it is because of this that [...]) and also with the compression of the verb phrase “enganán con voces de serea” [literally: they deceive with siren voices] into Medbh's re-creation “sing them like sirens”, as the allusion to the *Odyssey* is clear and needs no further particulars.

Steven Vertovec has argued that even “translocal understandings” are “anchored in places, with a variety of legal, political and cultural ramifications, not only for practices and meanings, but for the places as well”.⁷ If we conceive, as I would like to suggest in this article, translation as a kind of “translocal understanding”, we may want to examine how translations remain anchored to a place and the effects that derive from this rootedness. Lado's poem, though highly symbolic and meta-literary, abounds also in precise economic and environmental allusions alongside their concomitant social and cultural practices. The name of the island in the poem is “novembro” / “november”, a reference to the month when the oil-tanker *Prestige* sank off the Galician coast in 2002, contaminated the coast with its oil spillage and severely damaged the fishing-based economy. This environmental catastrophe had political, social and cultural consequences, since Galician writers were often at the head of social mobilizations against the political mismanagement of the crisis which led, in part, to the defeat of the conservative party then in power in the following Spanish (2004) and Galician (2005) parliamentary elections. The oil spillage also became the stimulus for numerous writers to form networks whose activities and projects had artistic and organizational consequences which went beyond the denunciation of the spillage.

Another socio-economic feature of the place depicted in the poem is inscribed in the word “percebes”, which alludes both to this seafood, which has become a very expensive delicacy in Spain, and to the dangerous harvesting practice it requires because, as the poem explains, the best gooseneck barnacles hide in deep grottoes beaten by strong waves. It is for this reason that María Lado speaks in her poem of deceitful and tempting barnacles, of the blind greed of men and of the ocean that swallows the fishermen now and then. Lado's poem clearly illustrates Vertovec's notion of the sundry social “ramifications” generated by a particular place. In this article, I intend to analyze the anchorage of literature in place and the effects of those social “ramifications” on translation.

One of my tasks as the co-editor of *To the Winds Our Sails* consisted in explaining all these cultural specificities of Galicia to the Irish writers who participated with their translations because, in spite of the common Atlantic Ocean shared by Ireland and Galicia — an ocean that can be envisaged as a “translocality” that has given rise through centuries to important transnational exchanges between both communities — a number of economic and cultural practices remain alien to each other. It is this strangeness that the word “percebes” patently manifests and that Máíghr ad Medbh,

that Galicia has had in Ireland as well as to contribute to the visibilization of minoritized vernaculars and women writers' work.

⁶ Medbh, “three,” 139.

⁷ Steven Vertovec, *Transnationalism* (London and New York: Routledge, 2009), 12.

clear-sightedly, maintained in her English version by not translating it. As I was preparing this article, I asked Medbh the reasons that led her to keep the Galician word in her English version. She mentioned her concern for formal aspects such as typography, “all those rounded letters”, and phonetics, “to reproduce as much of the Galician sound as I could”, but she was also intent on conveying the social “aspects of heroism and desperation” entailed by the harvesting of barnacles: “Retaining their own given name, the percebes become active personalities with all the strength of their native environment. I've allowed them to stay steady and unchanged on their cliffs, mysterious and powerful”.⁸ Medbh’s strategy is in line with Lawrence Venuti’s admonition that translation should not enact “a labor of acculturation which domesticates the foreign text”.⁹

The Irish poet Michael O’Loughlin, in his back cover commentary on the anthology, highlights the bonds between Galicia and Ireland but repeatedly qualifies these ties by signalling the strangeness that persists in these communities’ reciprocal glance: “Galicia has long been seen as our distant, neglected overseas cousin”, “[her poetry is] strangely familiar”. The family trope that binds both communities is checked by the relative otherness that Galicia still embodies for Ireland. Quite coincidentally, O’Loughlin illustrates, with a reference to María Lado’s poem, his belief in the capacity of translation to negotiate these “clashing tides” between both communities. It is for this reason that I chose this particular example of a translation practice to start my reflection on glocal identities in translation, transnational ties and the tensions between global forces and local claims.

“The common language of Europe is translation”, maintains the Italian philosopher Giacomo Marramao,¹⁰ who thus acknowledges the persistence of diversity and difference in the face of the cultural homogenization brought about by globalizing economic and political practices. The European Union recognizes, as official languages of its supranational institution, the state languages of the various member countries — though not other official vernaculars spoken in smaller areas of these same countries, as is the case with Galician. The Union also recommends the learning of two other European languages, but does not specify which ones. The fact that there is no official common language for all the member countries of the Union leads, therefore, to the necessity of translation. Since this is seen by many as a problem of inter-communicability, English is, in practice, the most common second language used in Europe and is included as an obligatory subject in the school curriculum of many countries.¹¹

There is the risk, however, that some speakers may perceive this major position of English as overbearing, which is the reason why writers of minoritized languages have evinced a variety of responses to this conflict. The Irish poet Biddu Jenkinson, for instance, refuses to have her Irish-language poetry translated into English, although she accepts to have it translated into other foreign languages such as French. Other Irish-language poets, however, often produce dual-language editions of their writings. Nuala

⁸ Máighr ad Medbh, Medbh’s electronic message sent to the author of this article on 18 August, 2012.

⁹ Lawrence Venuti, “Introduction,” in *Rethinking Translation. Discourse, Subjectivity, Ideology*, ed. Lawrence Venuti (London: Routledge, 1992), 5.

¹⁰ Giacomo Marramao, “Eguaglianza e differenza. Per una critica della democrazia identitaria” (lecture given at the Consello de Cultura Galega, Santiago de Compostela. November 18, 2011).

¹¹ Albert Bastardas i Boada, *Les pol tiques de la llengua i la identitat a l’era “glocal”*, (Barcelona: Institut d’Estudis Autonomics, 2007), 116.

Ní Dhomnaill has published bilingual collections in which other English-language writers re-create, in English, her Gaelic poems, while Celia de Fréine usually makes her own translations of her Irish-language poetry into English.¹² Practices such as de Fréine's entail a special interrogation of the common dichotomy original/translation, since both texts are of the same authorship and both appear published simultaneously in the same collection, so it is reasonable to expect that the writer has polished both versions concurrently by switching from one to another. In cases like this one, the question may even arise as to which version was conceived first, whether the Irish or the English one.

One of Galicia's best-known writers, Manuel Rivas, whose work has been translated into numerous international languages, usually has his work published first in Galician and, subsequently, in Castilian Spanish. His poetry collection *A desaparición da neve* (2009), however, was first published in a multilingual edition which included the original Galician version alongside the Catalan, Basque and Castilian translations. The reasons he adduced for this multilingual format were, in the literary critic and poet Martín Veiga's words, "an attempt to remove the ongoing social and political emphasis laid on linguistic conflict and to generate a greater recognition of the richness of linguistic plurality as a wealth that should be treasured".¹³

Other writers like to experiment with various possible combinations of major and minoritized languages. The Galician poet María do Cebreiro, for instance, has delved into her occasional use of English, French and Spanish titles for her Galician-language poems: "I believe in an idea of language that is constantly contaminated by other languages, voices, sounds. [...] I am very much drawn to the visual force of that clash between a hegemonic language and a language such as Galician, only spoken in that tiny corner in Spain".¹⁴ The poet thus turns the conflict that results from the power imbalance between languages into a creative strategy of fertile miscegenation. Something similar happens with the poetry by Lois Pereiro, a writer whose familiarity with and fondness for other European languages and literatures has led him to embed numerous foreign expressions and quotations in his Galician-language texts: "Non podo eludir a tentación de convertir a noite en night ou Nacht" [I cannot avoid the temptation of turning *noite* into night or Nacht].¹⁵

I have expressed elsewhere the interest of putting the extraordinary power of dissemination of an international language such as English at the service of minoritized languages in dual-language editions where the geographically and demographically

¹² Nuala Ní Dhomnaill's collection *Pharaoh's Daughter* (1990), for instance, appeared in a bilingual edition Irish/English with her Gaelic poems translated into English by a number of poets such as Ciaran Carson, Seamus Heaney, Michael Longley, Medbh McGuckian, etc., while *The Astrakhan Cloak* (1992) and *The Fifty Minute Mermaid* (2007) were published in dual-language editions with English translations by Paul Muldoon, and her 1999 collection *The Water Horse* included translations by Eiléan Ní Chuilleanáin. Celia de Fréine has published several poetry collections in Irish (*Faoi Chabáistí is Ríonacha* 2001, *Fiacha Fola* 2004), one in English (*Scarecrows at Newtownards* 2005) and two dual-language collections with her own translations into English (*imram : odyssey* 2010, *Aibítir Aoise : Alphabet of an Age* 2011). In 2012, de Fréine published two plays (*Plight : Cruachás* and *Desire : Meanmarc*) with Arlen House in dual-language editions.

¹³ Martín Veiga, "Snow, Memory and the Angel of History: Manuel Rivas at the Crossroads," in *The Disappearance of Snow* by Manuel Rivas, trans. Lorna Shaughnessy (Bristol: Shearsman Books, 2012), 10.

¹⁴ *Poetry Wales*, "In Conversation: María do Cebreiro and Menna Elfyn," *Poetry Wales*. 44.2 (2008): 11.

¹⁵ Manuel Rivas, "Lois Pereiro: Iste é un povo que sabe suicidar-se," *Luzes de Galicia* 0(1985): 8.

restricted vernacular language is accompanied by the English translation.¹⁶ These editions need to be bilingual if we do not want to contribute to the further suppression of the minoritized language by concealing it and thus rendering it irrelevant. Throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, a series of cultural associations in Ireland were concerned about the dramatic loss of Irish-language speakers. A number of intellectuals with very diverse agendas, such as James Clarence Mangan and Samuel Ferguson first and, afterwards, Lady Gregory and Patrick Pearse, devotedly engaged in the translation and/or recreation in English of popular oral culture with the objective of saving this cultural patrimony from oblivion.¹⁷ The irony was, however, that much of this folk wisdom could only survive in English and that the linguistic policies implemented did not manage to abate the loss of speakers of Gaelic. Therefore, one needs to be aware of the risk of the *bear hug* when a world language embraces a minoritized one. Translation should be, in this case, a site where the imbalance in the power relations of languages can be renegotiated in fairer terms. The possibility of bilingual editions is limited, however, by budget restrictions, and some genres seem more hospitable to this dual-language practice than others. It is not uncommon to find bilingual poetry collections, especially when they consist of the conventional one-page poem, but it is less common to find full-fledged novels in this bilingual format.

The rapid spread of the English language is a manifestation of present-day globalizing forces, but globalization arouses a deep anxiety in people. In Ireland —“one of the most globalized countries in the world” in Bob Holton’s words¹⁸ — some writers, such as Paula Meehan, see globalization as a modern version of imperialism that only serves the interests of First-World nations.¹⁹ Deirdre Madden has also avowed her suspicion of globalization, as she does not see that world-wide travel or telecommunications have really made people empathize with one another: “My loyalties would always be with the local”, she affirms.²⁰ Curiously enough, it is not just unempowered stateless nations that feel menaced by globalization but also strong nation states, as they perceive a growing loss of autonomy —nation states are, however, important agents of globalization, as they liberalize and deregulate the market, privatize public services and bring down borders.²¹

The local has also had its share of attacks when associated with derogatory terms like *parochial* or *provincial*. In her interview with the Irish writer Mary O’Donnell, Luz Mar González Arias asks her about the accusations of regionalism and localism that Irish literature has traditionally received. O’Donnell is highly critical of those discourses of inferiorization that dismiss a certain literary production by branding it as

¹⁶ Manuela Palacios, “Women Poets in Translation. An Introduction,” in *Forked Tongues*, ed. Manuela Palacios (Bristol: Shearsman, 2012), 7-8.

¹⁷ Thomas Kinsella, *The Dual Tradition. An Essay on Poetry and Politics in Ireland* (Manchester: Carcanet, 1995), 53, 58, 66, 72.

¹⁸ Bob Holton, Blurb for *Global Ireland. Same Difference*, by Tom Inglis (New York and London: Routledge, 2008).

¹⁹ Marisol Morales Ladrón and Juan F. Elices Agudo, “Introduction: The Politics of Glocality,” in *Glocal Ireland: Current Perspectives on Literature and the Visual Arts*, ed. Marisol Morales Ladrón, and Juan F. Elices Agudo (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011), 6.

²⁰ Marisol Morales Ladrón, ““My Loyalties Would Always Be with the Local”: A Conversation with Deirdre Madden,” in *Glocal Ireland: Current Perspectives on Literature and the Visual Arts*, ed. Marisol Morales Ladrón, and Juan F. Elices Agudo (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011), 249.

²¹ Manuel Castells, *Globalització i identitat / Globalisation and Identity* (Barcelona: Institut Europeu de la Mediterrània, 2003), 9-10, 15.

local.²² Elsewhere, O'Donnell has also expressed her critique of value-judgements, within the Irish literary system, that fetishize terms such as "international" or "European", and she has interrogated the frequent capitulation of Irish culture to English criteria of value.²³

There is a general penchant to oppose the global to the local as if they were two incompatible notions. However, definitions of the term "globalization" usually bring them together: "Globalization is the process whereby individual lives and local communities are affected by economic and cultural forces that operate world-wide".²⁴ Therefore, the phenomenon of globalization can only be assessed through its effect on the local. It is probably the failure of the term *globalization* to fully convey its relationship with the local that has stimulated the use of the term *glocal*, a word that originated in Japanese entrepreneurship but which soon proliferated in sociology in the 1990s.²⁵ It would be interesting to analyze, however, the converse case: the extent to which the local can transform the global either through strategies of resistance or by providing emergent and alternative discourses. Translation practices that re-negotiate power relations (global-local, male-female, North-South, etc.) could produce such alternative discourses. One should all the same take heed of Gayatri Spivak's warning about "the discourse of cultural specificity and difference, packaged for transnational consumption".²⁶ The danger in this case is to provide a *light* version of *foreignness* that can travel well and be digestible in an international context. This could lead to a reinforcement of stereotypes or identity signs that may be easily understood by readers world-wide.

As the editor of various anthologies of Galician and Irish poetry in translation, I have been concerned about the degree of cultural specificity that I could incorporate into these collections. Editors, publishers, translators, etc. of translated literature have a delicate role as they police what is or is not appropriate for foreign consumption. When editing the anthology *Pluriversos* (2003), I was interested in the *relevance* of contemporary Irish writing to the Galician literary system and society: the emergence of women writers, women's re-appropriation of their bodies, the critique of Catholic and Biblical discourses on femininity, the situation of vernacular languages, the hybridity of identities which results from processes of colonization, etc. Relevance, however, is not sameness, although it entails a sort of family resemblance and the possibility of learning from each other. Radical difference would render the other as a complete alien and would prevent the possibility of dialogue, because dialogue can only take place in the meeting point of relatively, not radically, different actors. In *Pluriversos*, one of the

²² Luz Mar González Arias, "'Dealing with Themes As They Arrive': A Conversation with Mary O'Donnell," in *Glocal Ireland: Current Perspectives on Literature and the Visual Arts*, ed. Marisol Morales Ladrón, and Juan F. Elices Agudo (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011), 266.

²³ Mary O'Donnell, "A European Poet," in *Musics of Belonging: The Poetry of Micheal O'Siadhail*, ed. Marc Caball, and David F. Ford (Dublin: Carysfort Press, 2007), 159, and Mary O'Donnell, "Irish Women's Drama: Questions of Response and Location" in *Creation, Publishing, and Criticism. The Advance of Women's Writing*, ed. María Xesús Nogueira, Laura Lojo, and Manuela Palacios (New York: Peter Lang, 2010), 201.

²⁴ Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin, "Globalization," in *Key Concepts in Post-Colonial Studies* (London and New York: Routledge, 1998), 110.

²⁵ Bastardas i Boada, *Les polítiques*, 29.

²⁶ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, "Who Claims Alterity?" in *Remaking History*, ed. Barbara Kruger and Paul Mariani (Seattle, WA: Bay, 1989), 276.

differences of Irish literature with regard to creative writing in Galician, or in other neighbour Romance languages, was still evidenced, for instance, through the reproduction of the Gaelic versions of Nuala Ní Dhomhnaill's poems.

As I edited the anthology *Forked Tongues* (2012), the Galician poet Lupe Gómez Arto suggested, upon my consultation, I include some texts from her recent book *Diálogos Imposíbeis* [Impossible Dialogues] (2010). These are texts which abound in references to local places and people unknown to a foreign reader, so I had to weigh which was the proper amount of specificity I should include in my selection. The criteria I followed for my decision were related to the genre of the texts, the overall degree of foreignness of the anthology and the expected reader. The poems from *Diálogos Imposíbeis* I included in the anthology contain references to one Galician and one Spanish writer, a local university professor, a café in the town where the poet resides, one local folk music instrument, local chinaware, etc. Some of these culturally-specific allusions required clarifying notes, but the genre of poetry is particularly attentive to the formal layout of the lines on the page, and cramming the page with footnotes or numbers for endnotes did not seem to be the right solution. I had to decide which allusions might be totally strange to a foreign reader and then included an appendix with notes at the end of the anthology. I only used notes for what I deemed were local, not international, references, so I explained, for instance, who Xohana Torres is, but not Wim Wenders. I also considered which of those allusions might only have Galician- or Spanish-language entries on the internet and would be, therefore, little known to the common English-language reader. I inserted, however, no numbers for those notes on the texts and trusted the reader would notice, on the initial Contents page, that there was a final section with notes. The poems by Gómez Arto that I selected seemed to have fewer local references than other texts in her collection, and I chose them because, overall, the anthology *Forked Tongues* already had a high degree of strangeness for an English-language reader with its original versions of Galician, Basque and Catalan poetry. The anthology was published by Shearsman, an English publisher, and I therefore had an English audience in mind, although present-day on-line bookstores conspicuously expand the range of readers.

One source of anxiety concerning globalization is that the world should become "a single place".²⁷ Akhil Gupta and James Ferguson maintain that "a transnational public sphere has certainly rendered any strictly bounded sense of community or locality obsolete".²⁸ Indeed, Arjun Appadurai has argued that electronic mediation has produced virtual neighbourhoods which have led to a disjuncture between territory and individual or collective subjectivity.²⁹ These new circumstances have not gone unnoticed to writers, who relish in the contrast between old and new social networks. Such is the case of the Irish poet Anne Le Marquand Hartigan, who, in her poem "Bare Necessity", contrasts the isolation of a woman emigrant in the early twentieth century with her descendants' facilities for travel and communication: "Throwing life-lines of

²⁷ Ashcroft et al., "Globalization," 110.

²⁸ Akhil Gupta and James Ferguson, "Beyond "Culture": Space, Identity, and the Politics of Difference," *Cultural Anthropology* 7(1992):9.

²⁹ Arjun Appadurai, "The Production of Locality," in *Counterworks*, ed. Richard Fardon, (London: Routledge, 1995), 213.

voice / Across oceans”.³⁰ As we see in the phrase “life-lines of voice”, telecommunications have also had their impact on poetic tropes.

Similarly, the Galician poet María do Cebreiro has recharged the metaphorical import of the word “navegar” [navigate/sail] in her response to Xohana Torres’ rewriting of the Penelope myth in the *Odyssey*. If Torres makes her Penelope exclaim that she also wants to take to sea: “EU TAMÉN NAVEGAR” [I sail too],³¹ María do Cebreiro makes her poetic persona surf the world-wide web: “EU TAMÉN NAVEGAR / [...] / Na rede a miña casa é o alfabeto” [I sail/surf too ... On the web my home is the alphabet].³² Although Appadurai believes that new technologies increase “difficulties of relating to, or indeed producing, “locality””,³³ Vertovec maintains that “there have emerged, instead, new “translocalities””.³⁴ The rapid increase in transnational connections between social groups in recent times is, in Vertovec’s view, “a key manifestation of globalization”.³⁵

Translocalities and transnational connections, however, are not an exclusive manifestation of modern processes of globalization. As Vertovec reminds us, social and cultural practices derived from particular localities “have always been transferred and regrounded”.³⁶ A translocality that has traditionally connected Galicia and Ireland is, for instance, the Atlantic Ocean. Galician nationalism has had recourse to this common space to establish mythical, political and cultural ties with Ireland. This proves that nationalism is not necessarily an essentialist and isolationist project, as it produces a series of discourses of kinship with other nations which are perceived as sharing similar social circumstances. Since the second half of the nineteenth century, Galician intellectuals have elaborated on the alleged Celtic brotherhood that bonds Galicia and Ireland by circulating discourses from the medieval manuscript *Lebor Gabála Érenn* [Book of Invasions of Ireland] on the mythical common founders of Ireland and Galicia: the Sons of Mil.³⁷

Some decades later, in the 1920s and 30s, the group of Galician intellectuals *Xeración Nós* [Generation Ourselves] continued to forge the ties between both nations on the basis of a common *Volksgeist* nourished by their common geographical location on the Atlantic.³⁸ Of special interest for this article is their translation work, as they rendered the poetry and drama of W.B. Yeats into Galician³⁹ and provided a pioneer translation of substantial fragments of James Joyce’s *Ulysses* in 1926 (Otero Pedrayo 1926).⁴⁰ The main reasons for their choice of writers were their common interest in Celtic mythology, the struggle for national sovereignty, the deep rootedness of

³⁰ Anne Le Marquand Hartigan, “Bare Necessity,” in *Immortal Sins* (Dublin: Salmon Publishing, 1993), 113.

³¹ Xohana Torres, “Penélope,” in *Poesía reunida (1957-2001)*, ed. Luciano Rodríguez (Santiago de Compostela: P.E.N. Clube de Galicia / Danú S.L., [1992] 2004), 251.

³² María do Cebreiro, “Eu tamén navegar,” in *O barrio das chinesas*. (Santiago de Compostela: Grupo El Correo Gallego / Concello de Santiago de Compostela, 2005), 104.

³³ Appadurai, “The Production of Locality,” 213.

³⁴ Vertovec, *Transnationalism*, 12.

³⁵ Vertovec, *Transnationalism*, 2.

³⁶ Vertovec, *Transnationalism*, 12.

³⁷ Santiago Lamas, *Fisterras atlánticas. Lecturas desde o cabo do mundo* (Vigo: Galaxia, 2012), 109-110, 121-123.

³⁸ Vicente Risco, “Irlanda e Galiza,” *Nós* 8 (1921): 18-20.

³⁹ Antón Vilar Ponte, trans., “Cathleen ni Houlihan,” by W.B. Yeats, *Nós* 8 (December 5): 8-13.

⁴⁰ Ramón Otero Pedrayo, “*Ulysses*. Anacos da soadísima novela de James Joyce. Postos en galego do texto inglés por Ramón Otero Pedrayo.” *Nós* 32 (August 15, 1926): 3-11.

Catholicism in Ireland and Galicia, and the international repute of these two Irish writers. What remains to be analyzed, however, is the little attention they paid to Gaelic-language writers. As I discussed above, Gaelic culture was spreading internationally, by the 1920s, mainly through its English-language practitioners. Besides, the apex of Modernist literature that W.B. Yeats and James Joyce stood for and that Galician intellectuals desired to engage with was written in English.⁴¹ In particular, we find an interest in Ireland on the part of certain Galician intellectuals who saw themselves as sharing common concerns such as geographic situation, foundational myths, ethnic background, national awareness in the face of colonization, religious beliefs and linguistic conflict. The translation and recreation of Irish literature by Xeración Nós was unfortunately a unilateral effort, with no correspondence on the part of Irish writers in the early decades of the twentieth century.

Nowadays, we might be tempted to believe that nationalism has no place and no future in a globalized world, but as Will Kymlicka and Christine Straehle have argued, “secession remains a live issue” within Western democracies, precisely because building the nation-state has often entailed “nation-destroying”.⁴² *Inventing* the nation-state has required *forgetting* local differences, but memory is stubborn and not easily wiped out. I would add that the anxieties provoked by globalization about the homogenization of the world re-ignite nationalist claims and, vice versa, the fear of isolationism fosters transnational practices and institutions. Rather than opposites, globalization and nationalism seem to stimulate each other. At any rate, globalization seems to pose no risk of obliteration of the local at present because, as Tom Inglis maintains: “The more sameness, the greater need for individual, local and national cultural differences to be created and maintained”.⁴³ Translation has a key role to play at this stage in the dissemination of the local through transnational projects that involve both stateless nations and nation-states. Such translational/transnational initiatives produce emergent discourses which, as Michael Cronin has suggested, help us conceive of place in a more dynamic and politically sophisticated fashion:

[...] in the investigation of the links between culture, place and language [...] it will be possible to develop a reading of, for example, non-metropolitan experience which is not condemned to a wistful *passéisme* but is forward-looking in its restoration of political complexity and cultural dynamism to all areas of territory and memory.⁴⁴

Reciprocity between empowered and unempowered cultures and languages seems to be a good starting ground for translation projects. Also, the transnational imaginary could be re-launched as a potent strategy to disseminate knowledge about the local. As we shall see in the following example of poetry in translation, this may result in interesting images of hybridity and syncretism. When Mary O’Donnell and I, as editors of *To the Winds Our Sails* (2010), asked the Galician poet Luz Pozo Garza to choose five of her poems so that the Irish poet Nuala Ní Dhomhnaill could translate them into

⁴¹ M. Teresa Caneda Cabrera, “The Loveliness Which Has Not Yet Come into the World. Translation as a Revisitation of Joyce’s (Irish) Modernism,” in *Irish Modernism and the Global Primitive*, ed. Maria McGarrity and Claire Culleton (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009).

⁴² Will Kymlicka and Christine Straehle, “Cosmopolitanism, Nation-States and Minority Nationalism: A Critical Review of Recent Literature,” *European Journal of Philosophy* 7.1 (1999): 76.

⁴³ Tom Inglis, *Global Ireland. Same Difference* (New York and London: Routledge, 2008), 259.

⁴⁴ Michael Cronin, *Translation and Identity* (Oxon: Routledge, 2006), 18.

English and Irish, Pozo Garza selected poetry she had written about her impressions of Ireland.⁴⁵ I see in their approach a welcome illustration of what I mean by reciprocity. The Galician poet wrote about Ireland and the Irish poet, who usually writes her poetry in Gaelic but has her work translated into English by other writers, rendered Pozo Garza's lines into both English and Gaelic—the *lingua franca* and the Irish vernacular. The unrequited translation enterprise that we had found in the work of Xeración Nós was now, at last, reciprocated. As Mary O'Donnell explains in the introduction to the anthology that gathers these poems, "there was a dearth of information and interest in Ireland regarding Galician poets".⁴⁶

The poems that Pozo Garza selected for this collection owe much of their inspiration to nationalist discourses, from the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, which revolved around the Celtic brotherhood of the Atlantic nations. However, what may seem today like a residual discourse on Celticism is revived in the Galician poet's hands, as she invests the traditionally bellicose account of the foreign founders with the affections of the mother-daughter bond. This starts a series of tropes of hybridity, as the Galician mother visits her daughter, who married an Irishman, in Dublin. In "Os palacios de inverno" / "Winter Palaces",⁴⁷ the translocality of the Atlantic acts as one of the links between both nations: "a alianza / dunha linaxe celta en dúas ribeiras" / "the alliance of a Celtic lineage / on two shores". This alliance should not involve, however, the erasure of the daughter's original national identity: "Non esquezas a patria" / "Do not forget your native land". Nuala Ní Dhomhnaill interestingly turns "fatherland" into "native land", thus avoiding not only the gender dichotomy between fatherland and motherland but also any possible jingoistic connotations. Apart from the common features shared by Ireland and Galicia, Pozo Garza is attentive to singular Irish places and pays homage to Irish cultural specificity and achievements in her poems: the Hill of Howth, Bran's sea, the dolmens, the Sidhe, Yeats, the round towers, torques and other treasures of the Kingdom of Tara, druids, the Tuatha Dé Danann, the symbols of the harp and the rose, etc. In her translation of "Avalon Avalon",⁴⁸ Ní Dhomhnaill actually seems to modify "Avalon"—the Welsh name of the Arthurian legendary island—to bring it to an Irish context, so "Emain Ablach" and "Avalon" are turned into "Eamhain Úllach", and "País das mazairas" [land of apple-trees] into "Oileán na n-Úll Cumhra" [the Island of Fragrant Apples]. We perceive, then, two simultaneous lines of force in both the original version and its translation: one of assimilation and another one of singularity and difference. There are moments, however, of effective syncretism, as in the final line of "Páxina Atlántica" / "Page of the Atlantic",⁴⁹ where the poet refers to the camellia, an omnipresent flower in Galician winter gardens, as the "camelia gaélica do xardín de Binn Eadair" / "the Gaelic camellia in a garden in Binn Eadair".

⁴⁵ Luz Pozo Garza, "Os palacios de inverno", "Páxina Atlántica", "Avalon Avalon," in *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, ed. Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios (Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010), 30, 38, 40-42.

⁴⁶ Mary O'Donnell, "Introduction," in *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, ed. Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios (Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010), 15.

⁴⁷ Pozo Garza, "Os palacios de inverno," 30.

⁴⁸ Nuala Ní Dhomhnaill, "Winter Palaces", "Page of the Atlantic", "Avalon Avalon," in *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, ed. Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios (Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010), 31, 39, 41-43.

⁴⁹ Ní Dhomhnaill, "Page of the Atlantic," 39.

This article has inquired into those translation strategies that allow us to maintain the local singularity of literary texts in transnational cultural projects. I have discussed the anxieties provoked by ill-suited notions of globalization and nationalism, and have found translation to be a very apt tool to overcome these anxieties. I have defended the notions of reciprocity and relative difference in translation projects as a fair basis to renegotiate bonds between empowered and disempowered groups. I have also shown that collaboration and hybridity in translation are not at all incompatible with and need not efface cultural specificity. As an editor of anthologies of poetry in translation, I have delved, with some necessary reservations, into the degree of foreignness that would be appropriate for the genre of poetry that addresses a specific audience. I have also staunchly argued for dual-language editions of poetry in order to grant the local vernaculars their due visibility. Finally, I have identified the local as a potential site of resistance to homogenizing forces by means of alternative discourses that take issue with globalizing impositions.

References

1. Appadurai, Arjun. "The Production of Locality." In *Counterworks*, edited by Richard Fardon, 204-225. London: Routledge, 1995.
2. Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin. "Globalization." In *Key Concepts in Post-Colonial Studies*, 110-115. London and New York: Routledge, 1998.
3. Bastardas i Boada, Albert. *Les polítiques de la llengua i la identitat a l'era "glocal"*. Barcelona: Institut d'Estudis Autònoms, 2007.
4. Caneda Cabrera, M. Teresa. "The Loveliness Which Has Not Yet Come into the World. Translation as a Revisitation of Joyce's (Irish) Modernism." In *Irish Modernism and the Global Primitive*, edited by Maria McGarrity and Claire Culleton, 115-132. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
5. Castells, Manuel. *Globalització i identitat / Globalisation and Identity*. Barcelona: Institut Europeu de la Mediterrània, 2003.
6. Cronin, Michael. *Translation and Identity*. Oxon: Routledge, 2006.
7. Gómez Arto, Lupe. *Diálogos imposibles*. Ames: Lavovento, 2010.
8. González Arias, Luz Mar. "'Dealing with Themes as They Arrive": A Conversation with Mary O'Donnell." In *Glocal Ireland: Current Perspectives on Literature and the Visual Arts*, edited by Marisol Morales Ladrón, and Juan F. Elices Agudo, 252-267. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011.
9. Gupta, Akhil, and James Ferguson. "Beyond "Culture": Space, Identity, and the Politics of Difference." *Cultural Anthropology* 7 (1992): 6-23.
10. Hartigan, Anne Le Marquand. "Bare Necessity." In *Immortal Sins*, 112-113. Dublin: Salmon Publishing, 1993.
11. Holton, Bob. Blurb for *Global Ireland. Same Difference*, by Tom Inglis. New York and London: Routledge, 2008.
12. Inglis, Tom. *Global Ireland. Same Difference*. New York and London: Routledge, 2008.
13. Kinsella, Thomas. *The Dual Tradition. An Essay on Poetry and Politics in Ireland*. Manchester: Carcanet, 1995.

14. Kymlicka, Will, and Christine Straehle. "Cosmopolitanism, Nation-States and Minority Nationalism: A Critical Review of Recent Literature." *European Journal of Philosophy* 7.1 (1999): 65-88.
15. Lado, María. "tres." In *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, edited by Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios, 138. Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010.
16. Lamas, Santiago. *Fisterras atlánticas. Lecturas desde o cabo do mundo*. Vigo: Galaxia, 2012.
17. María do Cebreiro. "Eu tamén navegar." In *O barrio das chinesas*. 104. Santiago de Compostela: Grupo El Correo Gallego / Concello de Santiago de Compostela, 2005.
18. Marramao, Giacomo. "Eguaglianza e differeza. Per una crita della democrazia identitaria." Lecture given at the Consello de Cultura Galega, Santiago de Compostela. November 18, 2011.
19. Medbh, Máighréad. Medbh's electronic message sent to the author of this article on 18 August, 2012.
20. Medbh, Máighréad. "three." In *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, edited by Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios, 139. Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010.
21. Morales Ladrón, Marisol. "'My Loyalties Would Always Be with the Local': A Conversation with Deirdre Madden." In *Glocal Ireland: Current Perspectives on Literature and the Visual Arts*, edited by Marisol Morales Ladrón, and Juan F. Elices Agudo, 244-251. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011.
22. Morales Ladrón, Marisol, and Juan F. Elices Agudo. "Introduction: The Politics of Glocality." In *Glocal Ireland: Current Perspectives on Literature and the Visual Arts*, edited by Marisol Morales Ladrón, and Juan F. Elices Agudo, 1-10. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011.
23. Ní Dhomhnaill, Nuala. "Winter Palaces", "Page of the Atlantic", "Avalon Avalon." In *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, edited by Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios, 31, 39, 41-43. Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010.
24. O'Donnell, Mary, and Manuela Palacios, eds. *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*. Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010.
25. O'Donnell, Mary. "Irish Women's Drama: Questions of Response and Location." In *Creation, Publishing, and Criticism. The Advance of Women's Writing*, edited by María Xesús Nogueira, Laura Lojo, and Manuela Palacios, 199-204. New York: Peter Lang, 2010.
26. O'Donnell, Mary. "Introduction." In *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, edited by Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios, 15-20. Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010.
27. O'Donnell, Mary. "A European Poet." In *Musics of Belonging: The Poetry of Micheal O'Siadhail*, edited by Marc Caball, and David F. Ford, 159-175. Dublin: Carysfort Press, 2007.
28. O'Loughlin, Michael. Blurb on the back cover of *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, edited by Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios. Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2012.

29. Otero Pedrayo, Ramón. "Ulysses. Anacos da soadísima novela de James Joyce. Postos en galego do texto ingles por Ramón Otero Pedrayo." *Nós* 32 (August 15, 1926): 3-11.
30. Palacios, Manuela. "Women Poets in Translation. An Introduction." In *Forked Tongues*, edited by Manuela Palacios, 7-20. Bristol: Shearsman, 2012.
31. Palacios, Manuela, ed. *Pluriversos: Seis poetas irlandesas de hoxe*. Santiago de Compostela: Follas Novas, 2003.
32. *Poetry Wales*. "In Conversation: María do Cebreiro and Menna Elfyn." *Poetry Wales*. 44.2 (2008): 10-14.
33. Pozo Garza, Luz. "Os palacios de inverno", "Páxina Atlántica", "Avalon Avalon." In *To the Winds Our Sails. Irish Writers Translate Galician Poetry*, edited by Mary O'Donnell, and Manuela Palacios, 30, 38, 40-42. Cliffs of Moher: Salmon Poetry, 2010.
34. Risco, Vicente. "Irlanda e Galiza." *Nós* 8 (1921): 18-20.
35. Rivas, Manuel. "Lois Pereiro: Iste é un povo que sabe suicidar-se." *Luzes de Galicia* 0 (1985): 7-9.
36. Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. "Who Claims Alterity?" In *Remaking History*, edited by Barbara Kruger and Paul Mariani, 269-292. Seattle, WA: Bay, 1989.
37. Torres, Xohana. "Penélope." In *Poesía reunida (1957-2001)*, edited by Luciano Rodríguez, 251. Santiago de Compostela: P.E.N. Clube de Galicia / Danú S.L., [1992] 2004.
38. Veiga, Martín. "Snow, Memory and the Angel of History: Manuel Rivas at the Crossroads." In *The Disappearance of Snow* by Manuel Rivas, trans. Lorna Shaughnessy, 9-12. Bristol: Shearsman Books, 2012.
39. Venuti, Lawrence. "Introduction." In *Rethinking Translation. Discourse, Subjectivity, Ideology*, edited by Lawrence Venuti, 1-17. London: Routledge, 1992.
40. Vertovec, Steven. *Transnationalism*. London and New York: Routledge, 2009.
41. Vilar Ponte, Antón, trans. "Cathleen ni Houlihan," by W.B. Yeats. *Nós* 8 (December 5): 8-13.

Identități global-locale în traducere

În ciuda tendințelor globalizante care promovează engleza ca pe noua *lingua franca*, limbile vernaculare ale diferitelor regiuni europene au conceput o serie de strategii care le ajută să supraviețuiască și să devină vizibile, strategii ce includ legături culturale mai strânse cu alte limbi aflate în minoritate și cu proiecte de traducere, cu sau fără medierea englezei. Lucrarea de față analizează un număr de traduceri din poezia irlandeză și galiciană, axându-se pe modul în care aceste traduceri construiesc identități global-locale printr-un proces ce transferă localul unei limbi și unei culturi *străine*. Mă voi axa asupra noțiunii de loc, întrucât Irlanda și Galicia au fost adesea văzute ca teritorii ce au în comun anumite trăsături geografice și de peisaj, printre altele. Deși voi discuta un număr de exemple în care se facilitează o recunoaștere reciprocă a locului, voi lua în considerație și diferitele semne de rezistență la această recunoaștere reciprocă.